

Postcode	Comments	Cruden Homes				Barratt Homes			
		Overall	'Wave' roof	Brickwork	Landscaping	Overall	Building design	Materials	Landscaping
EH151Ex	Barrett homes designs are totally bland "box like" housing not sufficient landscaping. Would like to see a bit more imagination .	Like	Like	Like	Like	Dislike	Dislike	Neutral	Dislike
EH151Tx		Neutral	Like	Neutral	Neutral	Like	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral
EH151Lx	Like the affordable housing design a lot: well considered, interesting design, especially the brickwork and the roof design. Adds a lot of interest to what is a simple block. An elegant response. The Barratt designs however look like they've been knocked up on the back of a fag packet. Doesn't look like there's been thought put into the aesthetics beyond throwing a few render panels and no, stair cores don't create much "interest " in a facade. They're a lazy and predictable response. Nice mix of housing types though.	Like	Like	Like	Like	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Neutral
EH151Lx	Barratt design looks like an off the peg solution with little to say it is in portobello. It looks like it would be cheap and nasty. The Cruden proposal is much more interesting and, if built will, would add to the built environment of the area. We need better quality new developments in portobello. I think the Cruden development could be high quality but I fear the Barratt one will be very poor.	Like	Like	Like	Like	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Neutral
EH152Rx	Crudens effort seems to have genuinely considered the local 'style' whereas Barratts looks just like any major development anywhere in the UK.	Like	Like	Like	Like	Neutral	Dislike	Neutral	Neutral
EH152Bx	Fishwives Causeway is the major cycle route into the centre of town from Portobello. Adding all these homes and cars and pedestrians to this street without providing dedicated cycle lanes would be unhelpful, dangerous and go against the need to encourage non-carbon, healthy transport. For this development to go ahead it needs to take on board the need to support, rather than impede, green transport. A major issue for those living in flats/ tenements in Portobello is the lack of secure and covered bicycle storage facilities. This leads to people either not using bikes or parking them in the stairs in a way that obstructs neighbours. Ensuring sufficient secure and covered bicycle storage facilities in this development is crucial.	Neutral	Like	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral
EH151Ax	Edinburgh is a old city rich in architectural character. Portobello is also a conservation area. I would much prefer to see less bland boxes and more designed buildings taking cues from the many wonderful older buildings around Edinburgh.	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike
EH152Ax		Neutral	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Neutral
EH151Hx		Like	Like	Like	Neutral	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Neutral
EH151Hx	the cruden design looks monolithic and dull and will probably age badly	Dislike	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral	Like	Neutral
EH151Lx	the Barrat homes design lacks any inovation or imagination, especially the town houses.	Neutral	Like	Neutral	Like	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Neutral
EH152Hx		Like	Neutral	Neutral	Like	Like	Like	Like	Like
EH151Lx	Very little greenspace in an area already lacking greenspace. Rather reminiscent of a factory and without any architectural merit. It reminds me of an industrial 1960s style ghetto housing project. No thought to create a varied interesting living environment with use of natural materials. Will further overload already hugely overloaded schools. Do not approve of any supermarket for Portobello which seems to be hidden in the middle of these plans. Quite depressing really.	Dislike	Neutral	Dislike	Dislike	Neutral	Neutral	Dislike	Dislike

Postcode	Comments	Cruden Homes				Barratt Homes			
		Overall	'Wave' roof	Brickwork	Landscaping	Overall	Building desig	Materials	Landscaping
EH151Ex	I feel that this is very much an attempt to max pack the site with terraced houses and flatted blocks, the materials and design of the builds on there own are good but when you have them in a continuous line of terraced houses and 4 stairs inline it makes for an ugly development. As much as I welcome development of Portobello it needs to make a positive impact.	Dislike	Dislike	Like	Neutral	Dislike	Dislike	Neutral	Neutral
EH151Hx	Very unimaginative	Neutral	Dislike	Like	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike
EH152Qx	Barrettes design have to many flats for the plot . No privacy as windows overlook each other. Will also cause congestion coming and going from the area to Potobello high street and by-pass	Like	Like	Like	Like	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Neutral
EH152Hx	Barratt - Very cheap looking finish and potential for discoloured render or other materials to frontage. Very bland overall design, looking like no imagination or rel effort has gone into the proposal. I don't see any likeness to existing Portobello properties. Cruden - Decent design by today's bland standards. Wave roof gives a little character and reference to the industrial origins of the area. No rendering or other finishing to age and take away from overall appearance. Solid continuous brickwork giving solid look with at least bit of quality appearance.	Neutral	Like	Like	Like	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Like
EH152Rx	Really need to weave more into landscaping which connects people to greenspace (Arthur's seat in west) and blue space (firth of forth in East) and to build in active travel routes from the outset. Could have better landscaping to encourage biodiversity green corridors/patches and not just a sterile environment with a few trees. Native tree species, native flower meadows, green corridors along active networks should be introduced.	Neutral	Like	Neutral	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Neutral	Dislike
EH151Tx		Like	Like	Like	Like	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral
EH151Nx	Ugly, functional, cheap looking boxes. We need houses that look like homes, with pitched roofs, private space and gardens	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike
EH152Jx		Like	Dislike	Like	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral	Dislike	Neutral
EH151Dx	As a local resident (I live in fishwives causeway) I think this second design is more thoughtful and appropriate. It will be a more attractive site in general and appealing to potential residents.	Dislike	Like	Neutral	Like	Like	Like	Like	Like
EH152Px	Looks like cheap office blocks	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Neutral	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Neutral
EH151Ax	Strongly dislike the buff brick and grey feature panel design. Very dated.	Like	Like	Like	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral	Dislike	Neutral
EH152Px	The Cruden building looks like an office block. The brickwork surface is far too flat. Surely a more imaginative design could be used?	Dislike	Neutral	Like	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral
EH152Qx	The Barratt design is uninspiring and ordinary. This could be a great opportunity to be creative in the design and materials. The houses in particular are functional looking.	Like	Like	Like	Like	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike
EH87Rx	Long overdue.	Like	Like	Like	Like	Like	Like	Like	Like
EH152Bx		Neutral	Dislike	Neutral	Like	Neutral	Neutral	Like	Like

Postcode	Comments	Cruden Homes				Barratt Homes			
		Overall	'Wave' roof	Brickwork	Landscaping	Overall	Building desig	Materials	Landscaping
EH74Px	It is most appreciated to have the opportunity to comment and good to know plans are underway to make use of this land. But is this not just to help the approval of a big supermarket ? Lets not see yet another visual disaster in Portobello like the Bath Street flats overlooking the prom or monsters besides the Potteries/Tumbles. These two proposals lack any connectivity, why proposed separately with different materials and designs. Why some pitched roofs and some looking like parapets? What about creating external places for people? Have a look at the new Housing by Cruden at Gracemount for example. The visualisation simply ignores the Harry Lauder Road, which is a very noisy main road , not ideal to locate Housing adjacent to. How do the designs relate to people walking from Portobello High Street? But I suppose supermarkets wish you to drive? The whole development would benefit from being designed as a whole,	Dislike	Dislike	Neutral	Neutral	Dislike	Dislike	Like	Dislike
EH152Ax	Yet another faceless featureless bland block dumped down with no thought for the surrounding or the residents	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Like	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike
EH152Jx	Nothing offensive about either design but they're not very exciting either. Would prefer to see more balconies and outside space for individual flats.	Neutral	Like	Dislike	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral	Like	Neutral
EH76Qx	The roadway is very dominant in the Cruden design as shown, not clear in the Barrett design. Underground Carparking should be considered to leave the ground level space as green as possible, especially as the site borders a big main road. Presumably there will be a link to the cycle paths around. I hope the cycle parking will be using the sensible'Sheffield' racks	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral	Dislike	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral
EH152Px	On the whole these Barratt houses look as though they are well spaced out but it would appear there are too many homes planned for this small area and they are very close to the Residential Housing and that could end up being noisy for those residents. I personally would not like to buy a Crudens residential dwelling so close to a built up area. But I am sure all this has been taken into account. The area will certainly benefit from further housing and will enhance the Portobello area.	Neutral	Neutral	Like	Like	Dislike	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral
EH217Lx	Once again it seems housing designers are opting for the lowest common denominator. Bland, unattractive housing that lack any original thought or plan. These designs look like offices, not homes. They make no nod to the Scots vernacular style - rather they could be from anywhere in the UK. Why not take inspiration from traditional Scottish architecture? The houses being built in St Mark's Lane in Portobello demonstrate what is achievable with modern housing. They incorporate pleasing details like dormer windows and traditional stone in a new-build. These, meanwhile, are extremely poor. I hope the council will insist the designs are rejected and that something more worthy of our capital city is built.	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike
EH152Hx		Neutral	Like	Like	Neutral	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike
EH152Jx	Crudens design is like a poorly designed cardboard box. Barrat's is basic Barrat's, with minimal imagination and obviously being built to a price. Surely some alternative material than brick could be used to give a less regimented look.	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Neutral	Neutral	Dislike	Dislike	Neutral

Postcode	Comments	Cruden Homes				Barratt Homes			
		Overall	'Wave' roof	Brickwork	Landscaping	Overall	Building desig	Materials	Landscaping
EH152Nx	Where's the vision? What does it aspire to? Architecture can have a massive impact on the community it hosts. The colony flats built at the end of the 19th century around Edinburgh for example helped create a real community spirit that is still very special. Abroad, especially in the Scandinavian countries, they are rethinking architecture to make every-day living more environmentally friendly and sociable. Shouldn't every building project in the city aim to offer something more to its future residents and existing surrounding residents?	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike
EH151Hx	Cruden: I like the use of brick as proposed but I find the flats too high and the broad waves of the roof structure lacking in detail (opposite to the detail in the use of brick) and as it stands I find the roof a bit strange and out of proportion. Barratt: If I think of colony style I think of Stockbridge or Alva Place. I have not been able to identify any of those characteristics in the Barratt Homes drawings. A townhouse is a traditional 3-4 story building. A unit in such a building is usually called a flat. The townhouse on display is bombastic and lacks creativity.	Dislike	Dislike	Like	Like	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Neutral
EH151Hx	Where are the play park and other facilities for children and young people? This design seems to do nothing to encourage health, wellbeing and socialisation. Fishwives Causeway is the major cycle route into the centre of town from Portobello. And Edinburgh aspires to be a cycle friendly city. With so many new homes (and cars and pedestrians) there is now more than ever a pressing need to provide dedicated cycle lanes to enable and encourage non-carbon, non-congesting, healthy transport. The development needs to support, rather than impede, green transport. A major issue for those living in flats/ tenements in Portobello is the lack of secure and covered bicycle storage facilities. This leads to people either not using bikes or parking them in the stairs in a way that obstructs neighbours. Providing sufficient secure and covered bicycle storage facilities in this development is crucial.	Neutral	Neutral	Like	Dislike	Neutral	Neutral	Dislike	Dislike
EH151Tx	I am horrified at the amount of brick involved in the construction. It means that the development has no Scottish character whatsoever and looks like any other bland development in England. I would have liked to have seen some attempt to infuse some Scottish elements such as stepped gables, no flat roofs, which are not suitable for our environment, and some stone facing or harling in character with the Forth and its seaside history! There is already a preponderance of brick in the development of the old Power Station site and near the Pottery Kilns. Some contrast in style and appearance would stop the area from becoming a brick wilderness!	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Neutral	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike
EH151Jx	More ghastly prison style flats. Too high and too much cramped into a small area. The new buildings in Edinburgh are just getting too tall. It's all about builders profits. Need for more houses.	Dislike	Neutral	Neutral	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike	Dislike